

**IRONDEQUOIT PUBLIC LIBRARY**  
**BUILDING PROGRAMS & BUDGET ANALYSIS**

**MAY 2005**

**Prepared by:**  
**Panz Library Consulting**  
**1219 Lake Point Drive**  
**Webster, NY 14580**  
**585-748-7749**

## **CONTENTS**

- I. SCOPE OF WORK & APPROACH**
- II. BUILDING PROGRAM SUMMARIES**
  - a. SINGLE FACILITY**
  - b. TWO BRANCHES (EAST & WEST)**
  - c. USING CURRENT SITES – WEST BRANCH REDUCTION OPTIONS**
- III. BUDGET IMPACT - SINGLE FACILITY VS TWO BRANCHES**
- IV. RECOMMENDATIONS & CONCLUSIONS**
- V. APPENDICES**
  - a. SINGLE FACILITY PROGRAMS**
  - b. EAST BRANCH PROGRAM**
  - c. WEST BRANCH PROGRAM**
  - d. SPREADSHEETS COMPARING OPTIONS**

### **SCOPE OF WORK & APPROACH**

Panz Library Consulting was engaged by the Irondequoit Public Library through a contractual agreement with The Thomas Group to develop building programs based on a single 50,000 square foot facility serving the entire Town of Irondequoit and another that entailed two branches, each serving one-half of the town's

## IRONDEQUOIT PUBLIC LIBRARY - BUILDING PROGRAMS & BUDGET ANALYSIS

50,000 population. In developing the programs, the consultant was directed to maintain equity in the level of public services provided by each branch. Additionally, the core of non-public, support and administrative services were to be located in the east side branch, mainly due to the fact that the existing site could more easily accommodate a larger facility. The consultant was also asked to perform an analysis of the impact on the library's overall budget based on operating a single library outlet versus two branches.

The consultant began the process by developing a preliminary generic estimate of space needs for a library serving a population of 50,000. That process confirmed the need for a facility (or facilities) totaling between 45,000 to 50,000 square feet based on current collection estimates, and generally accepted library planning guidelines covering public seating and staff space requirements. The estimate also accommodated growth over a 20-year period.

The library was then asked to confirm actual collection counts at each branch. Using detailed collection data compiled by library staff, the consultant then developed an estimate of required space to house the collections based on recommended shelving configurations taking into account future growth. Meetings were held with staff at each branch to obtain input on desired program elements based on current operational procedures. Differences in operational procedures voiced by staff at the two branches were resolved by the library director.

The consultant also reviewed available usage data for each of the two existing branches and collected anecdotal information on the characteristics of library patrons. Unfortunately, the library's computer system was unable to provide data indicating where the patrons from each branch come from i.e. where they live. This could have helped pinpoint the level of crossover use between the two branches by Irondequoit residents. Also, there were no recent surveys available to indicate how many patrons walk to the branches vs. drive. This additional data would have helped determine the extent to which the branches are primarily serving their individual neighborhoods and could have contributed to an ultimate decision as to whether the library should operate one or two outlets. In spite of the lack of this data, the information available from staff was sufficient to proceed with the development of the building programs, which are non-dependent on library location

### Single Library Outlet

Based on collection counts and staff input, a draft program for a single facility serving the entire town was created. The program called for a facility of 50,742 sq. ft. Input on the draft building program was obtained through a second series of meetings with staff that also took into consideration suggestions voiced at a design charette held on March 18 and 19, 2005.

### Two Branch Scenario

Following the development of a building program for a single facility serving the entire town, the consultant prepared draft building programs for two branches – one serving the eastern portion of the town and the other serving the western portion. The draft programs were reviewed by staff at each branch. As mentioned above, the public portions of each branch were essentially equal in size and scope, while most administrative and support services were assigned to the east branch. This resulted in programs calling for an east branch of 29,176 sq. ft. and a west branch of 26,251 sq. ft. The combined space required for the two branch scenario is greater than the amount of space required for a single facility due to required duplication of certain elements. These will be discussed further in another section of this report.

### Additional work – branches of unequal size

Following completion of the building programs mentioned above, the consultant was asked to develop a modified two-branch scenario taking into consideration the site constraints of the current branch locations. Based on work by the Thomas Group, it has been determined that the Cooper Road (West) site could not support a facility in excess of 15,000 sq. ft., while the east branch faced no similar constraint. Meetings were then scheduled with staff at each branch to identify how the space should be allocated between the two

## **IRONDEQUOIT PUBLIC LIBRARY - BUILDING PROGRAMS & BUDGET ANALYSIS**

branches. As a result, two options for reducing the scope of service at the Evans Branch were developed and reviewed with staff. A summary of these options is included within this final report.

**BUILDING PROGRAM SUMMARIES**

The Detailed Building Programs appended to this report are based on generally accepted library space planning guidelines and requirements articulated by key staff of the Irondequoit Public Library. This input was obtained through a review of individual staff vision statements provided to the consultant and input obtained through multiple meetings with staff of the Evans and McGraw Branches and the library director. In addition to focusing on a combined staff vision for a single library facility serving the entire town of Irondequoit, the meetings also reviewed requirements for two separate branches serving the East and West portions of the town.

The Detailed Building Programs specify collection shelving requirements, seating and program areas for single and multiple library outlets. These Programs should be used as a guide for the layout of the library and also as a yardstick to assess various expansion options from the library operations point of view. It is recognized that some adjustments to these programs may be required to meet limitations caused by budget and/or renovation of the existing library facilities. In these cases, care should be taken to assign priorities to areas within the Programs to ensure that the trade-offs do not detract from the efficient operation of the library. Library staff should be heavily involved in this process, if required.

**Facility planning guidelines**

In approaching the design for the new Irondequoit Public Library, whether for a single facility or two new branches, the following guidelines should be followed whenever possible:

**Computers & wiring**

The facility should accommodate placement of computer workstations in all public and staff areas of the facility without unsightly and potentially unsafe wiring in open spaces. This can be accommodated by placement of a wiring grid (or at a minimum, conduit for running cable) under the floor. The ability to tap into the wiring grid should be available at regular intervals to enable installation of outlets and cable jacks. Though the library is planning to migrate to a wireless network for its computer workstations, plans still need to be in place to bring electricity to all areas of the floor. The library intends to become an “internet hot spot” which will enable patrons to access the Internet via the library’s wireless network via their own laptop computers. The design and layout of the library should accommodate this environment.

**Security**

The library facility should have only one public entrance, which will enhance visual security and allow for efficient acquisition and installation of a new materials security system. The new library design should provide library staff with a clear line of site to all or most public areas of the facility. This is especially important in locating the circulation desk and staff desks and offices. All offices, public meeting rooms and other enclosed areas should have large glass windows or glass walls to assist visibility. This report assumes that the library will install a materials security system that will allow all or most of media (Video cassettes, DVD’s etc) to be placed out on the floor to facilitate access by the public. In the event that this does not occur, additional shelving needs to be accounted for behind the circulation desk. The facility should be equipped with a public address system that can be used to alert patrons to emergencies, library service announcements, including closing announcements.

**Flexibility**

The entire library should be designed with flexibility in mind to enable the library to move shelving, computers, public seating and furnishings freely about. Though the initial floor plan will accommodate current library needs, change is inevitable, and the facility design should anticipate the need for future changes in the floor-plan. Permanent structures within the facility that may inhibit future change should be kept to a minimum and lighting, electrical and other fixtures should accommodate potential changes in floor layouts.

## IRONDEQUOIT PUBLIC LIBRARY - BUILDING PROGRAMS & BUDGET ANALYSIS

### Access and operating efficiency – single floor

To facilitate public access and to provide the maximum efficiency in library operations, the library should be located on one floor with no change in elevation throughout the building requiring stairs or extensive ramping. This will not only provide the public with convenient access to all portions of the library but it will also enable staff to more easily transport materials within the library. Having all staff on one floor will provide an opportunity for departments to back each other up during periods of high usage and also when staff shortages occur due to illness, vacation and other reasons. Whenever possible aisles between book stacks should be 42” wide to accommodate wheelchair access throughout the facility.

### User-friendly and appealing atmosphere

It is recognized that the ultimate design of the library will reflect the creativity of the architect and elements included within this building program as voiced by library staff. In general, the library should have an “open” and “welcoming” feel and appeal to all age groups. An effort should be made to bring natural light into the facility without producing glare or a negative impact on energy usage.

### How large should the library be?

Many factors contribute to the decision on how large a library should be within a particular community. The Irondequoit Public Library currently operates two branches with combined space of approximately 24,000 sq. ft. Based on the population of the Town of Irondequoit, library space planning guidelines call for a facility of 40,000 to 50,000 sq. ft. However, when planning for a library, additional factors need to be considered, such as the type and level of programming and services offered to the community and the specific space requirements to adequately house collections, computers and staff. In addition, it is important that a Library Building Program also anticipate future growth to ensure that any new facility will continue to meet the community’s needs for several years into the future. The detailed Building Programs included in this report anticipate growth over a 20-year period. The amount of shelving allocated for the collection has been sized to accommodate an annual growth of the collection of 2% to 3% per year. This modest annual collection growth rate takes into account the shift to electronic resources that will continue to occur. Though the shift may slow down collection growth, it will be offset by an increase the demand for floor space allocated to computers. It should be noted that the estimated space requirement for furniture, shelving, carts, meeting rooms, offices and equipment included in these Building Programs are estimates only. Firm space requirements should be confirmed though the development of actual floor layouts prepared by an architect. In addition, it is recognized that when developing actual floor plans for a facility, it may not be possible to meet all of the desired adjacencies proposed within these Building Programs. In this case, care should be taken to dialogue with staff to determine adjacency priorities.

### Single library facility - space allocation summary

Based on a review of the library’s current resources and services and the desired elements to be incorporated into a new single library facility serving the Town of Irondequoit as articulated by staff, the detailed Building Program for a single facility calls for the following space allocations:

<u>Square feet</u>	<u>Program Component</u>
16,994	ADULT SECTION
6,890	CHILDREN’S SECTION
1,446	YOUNG ADULT SECTION
6,690	ENTRY AREA & MEETING ROOMS
7,013	NON-PUBLIC AREAS
<u>11,709</u>	UNASSIGNABLE (30% of above program components)*
50,742	TOTAL FACILITY ESTIMATE

\* Note: “Unassignable space” is the area within a building that is required for corridors, restrooms, movement of people, etc. It is normally the difference between the calculation of net and gross square footage. Standard guidelines for library space planning recommends that between 25% and 30% of gross square footage be allocated for this purpose. This report assumes 30%

## **IRONDEQUOIT PUBLIC LIBRARY - BUILDING PROGRAMS & BUDGET ANALYSIS**

### **Program highlights – single facility**

In addition to incorporating space for the library’s current collections and services, the Building Program for a single facility serving the entire town calls for several enhanced features including:

- Outdoor reading garden and play area for children
- Drive up book drop
- Separate Book Sale Room
- Public eating area with café tables and vending machines
- Two large state of the art meeting rooms, each accommodating up to 200 people
- Kitchen facility to support activities in meeting rooms
- Separate Local History Room within Reference Department
- Community “Music Resource Room”
- Eight small meeting/tutoring rooms available for public use
- Wireless network allowing the library to serve as an Internet “Hotspot”
- Wired furniture accommodating use of personal laptop computers
- Greatly expanded public seating and computer workstations
- Clusters of comfortable seating throughout – especially in the magazine newspaper area
- Separate craft and story hour rooms within the Children’s Section
- Glassed-in computer resource area
- A new security system to prevent loss of library materials
- Efficient work cubicles and offices for key staff
- Separate loading dock area to facilitate delivery of books, equipment and other items

### **Two branch scenario - space allocation summaries**

The Detailed Building Programs for branches serving the eastern and western portions of the Town of Irondequoit are based on the same generally accepted library space planning guidelines that were applied to the single library facility Building Program. However, these Programs have been customized to a certain degree to reflect the specific needs expressed staff at each branch. For the most part, except for the placement of local history and music resource rooms at the East branch, the public areas of the branches are comparable in size and have the same number of public seats and computers. The non-public portions of the facilities differ in size due to the placement of behind the scenes administrative and technical services at the East branch.

### **East branch – space allocation**

Based on a review of the library’s current resources and services and the desired elements articulated by staff to be incorporated into a new branch serving the eastern portion of the Town of Irondequoit the East Branch Building Program calls for the following space allocations:

<u>Square feet</u>	<u>Program Component</u>
9,213	ADULT SECTION
3,299	CHILDREN’S SECTION
818	YOUNG ADULT SECTION
3,900	ENTRY AREA & MEETING ROOMS
5,213	NON-PUBLIC AREAS
6,733	UNASSIGNABLE (30% of above program components)*
29,176	TOTAL FACILITY ESTIMATE

## **IRONDEQUOIT PUBLIC LIBRARY - BUILDING PROGRAMS & BUDGET ANALYSIS**

### **East Branch - program highlights**

In addition to incorporating space for the library's current collections and services, the Building Program for a new branch serving the eastern portion of the town calls for several enhanced features including:

- Large meeting room – seating for 200
- Kitchen facility – available to meeting room
- Story hour/craft room – accommodating up to 30 children
- Separate identifiable Sections for Adult, Children and Young Adults
- Book sale alcove
- A new security system to prevent loss of library materials
- Local History Room
- Community “Music Resource” Room
- Three small tutoring/study rooms
- Computer resource area – 5 pc's (glass enclosed)
- Wireless network – Internet “hotspot”
- Public eating area – vending machines
- Drive up book drop
- Clusters of comfortable seating throughout – especially in the magazine newspaper area
- Administrative Offices
- Technical Services Office
- Information Technology Department
- Staff work area with cubicles
- Loading dock area

### **West Branch – space allocation**

Based on a review of the library's current resources and services and the desired elements articulated by staff to be incorporated into a new branch serving the western portion of the Town of Irondequoit the West Branch Building Program calls for the following space allocations:

<u>Square feet</u>	<u>Program Component</u>
8,142	ADULT SECTION
4,035	CHILDREN'S SECTION
905	YOUNG ADULT SECTION
3,144	ENTRY AREA & MEETING ROOMS
3,967	NON-PUBLIC AREAS
<u>6,058</u>	UNASSIGNABLE SPACE (30% of above program components)*
26,251	TOTAL FACILITY ESTIMATE

### **West Branch - program highlights**

In addition to incorporating space for the library's current collections and services, the Building Program for a new branch serving the western portion of the town calls for several enhanced features including:

- Large meeting room – seating for 200
- Kitchen facility – available to meeting room
- Story hour/craft room – accommodating up to 45 children
- Separate identifiable Sections for Adults, Children and Young Adults
- Three small tutoring/study rooms
- Computer resource area – 5 pc's (glass enclosed)
- Book sale alcove
- Public eating area – vending machines

## **IRONDEQUOIT PUBLIC LIBRARY - BUILDING PROGRAMS & BUDGET ANALYSIS**

- Clusters of comfortable seating throughout – especially in the magazine & newspaper area
- Wireless network – Internet “hotspot”
- Drive up book drop
- A new security system to prevent loss of library materials
- Offices for key staff
- Server & computer equipment room
- Staff work area with cubicles
- Loading dock area

**USING CURRENT SITES – WEST BRANCH REDUCTION OPTIONS**

Analysis has indicated that the Town of Irondequoit should have a library facility or facilities totaling between 45,000 and 50,000 sq. ft. in order to adequately house collections and serve the community. As a result, the consultant developed a building program for a single facility of 50,000 sq. ft and two separate building programs for equal size branches of approximately 25,000 sq. ft. each.

If the library elects to utilize the existing sites for expansion of the branches, it has been determined that the existing Evans branch site (Cooper Road) can support a facility of no more than 15,000 sq. ft.; an increase of 3,000 sq. ft. over the current facility. In addition, in order to achieve that expansion, the library may have to add another floor, resulting in a facility of three levels – main floor, lower level (housing current meeting room) and a new second level.

While there are serious expansion constraints at the Evans branch, there are no similar constraints at the McGraw branch, which could be expanded to 35,000 sq. ft.. A 15,000 sq. ft. Evans branch and a 35,000 sq. ft. McGraw branch would meet the 50,000 sq. ft. need within the town, but result in two branches offering very different levels of service. The community must recognize this trade-off if the determination is made to retain a branch on Cooper road.

In addition, the library board and administration should note that a branch consisting of three levels is inconsistent with one of the guiding principles of the library’s building program, which is to have a library or libraries that occupy no more than one floor. Multiple floor configurations pose additional security and staffing concerns which may result in increased operating costs. For example, for security reasons, it is not recommended that a floor be open to the public without some staff being present to monitor activity. Additionally, a single staff member alone on a floor, especially during evening hours, may not be able to adequately monitor potentially disruptive activity and may even be susceptible to harassment himself or herself. To cope with this, many libraries in urban areas will not schedule fewer than two staff members on each floor – resulting in significantly higher operating costs.

In spite of the above, it is recognized that the community and the library board may still be willing to retain an Evans branch with multiple levels and with limited services compared to a McGraw branch. Because of this potential, an effort has been made to identify two options for utilizing 15,000 sq. ft. of space at the Evans branch site. These are highlighted below.

**Option A – full service branch – with fewer amenities**

Under this option, the library would continue to provide a full array of services to the public. However, there would be fewer seats and computers, smaller and fewer meeting rooms and less programming space and amenities than would be available in a facility of 25,000 square feet. The branch would retain its current collection but it would be housed in less than optimum conditions. For example: typical library space planning guidelines call for a shelving density of 10 items per square foot. This would result in 42-inch aisles between stacks (adequate for wheelchair access), shelves that are 2/3 full and no materials being placed on the top or bottom shelves of each section of shelving. This configuration allows for easy access to materials and accounts for collection growth over a 20-year period. However, in order to meet the 15,000 sq. ft. limitation at the Evans branch, a more aggressive shelving arrangement would be required that calls for a shelving density of 15 items per square foot. This will result in 36-inch aisles between stacks and utilization of the top and lower shelves in each section of shelving. The library will have a less “open” feel and shelves may approach being overcrowded in 10 years or even sooner. The following is a list of services and amenities that could be available with Option A, compared to those identified within a 25,000 sq. ft. branch. The spreadsheet in the appendix shows sq. ft. comparisons for each area.

## **IRONDEQUOIT PUBLIC LIBRARY - BUILDING PROGRAMS & BUDGET ANALYSIS**

### **Option A - Services & amenities compared to those available in two branches of equal size (25,000 sq. ft)**

- Less than optimum shelving configuration – narrower aisles, top and bottom shelves utilized, 10-year growth potential.
- Multiple levels – potential security concerns requiring additional staffing
- 75 seat meeting room compared to 200
- No kitchen facility available to meeting rooms
- No book sale alcove
- No public eating area
- 67 public seats in adult, children's and young adult areas compared to 102
- 21 computer workstations compared to 27
- 2 small meeting rooms compared to 3
- One small programming area for children compared to separate enclosed rooms for crafts and programs
- No YA game table
- Smaller circulation desk
- No office for director
- Smaller computer room
- Smaller work tables for staff
- Less shelving and storage in staff area
- Smaller staff lunch room
- No loading dock

### **Option B – Change focus of branch to a circulating library**

Under this option, the branch would concentrate on and strengthen its role as a circulating library and at the same time drop other services that do not support this role. In this scenario optimum space is provided for the collection - accommodating growth over a 20-year period. To make room for the collection, other areas and services are reduced in scope or eliminated altogether. In this case, patrons would need to visit the McGraw branch for these services. For example, the Evans branch would provide extremely limited reference service and programming. No separate programming room would be available for children. A small meeting room with seating for 50 would be available but it would have no kitchen facilities. There is some rationale for this option based on the fact that the Evans branch already accounts for more than half of the total circulation in Irondequoit. This option would reinforce the branch's role as a circulating library.

### **OPTION B - Services & amenities compared to those available in two branches of equal size (25,000 sq. ft)**

- Optimum shelving configuration provided – 42-inch aisles, top and bottom shelves freed up, 20-year growth potential.
- Multiple levels – potential security concerns requiring additional staffing
- 50 seat meeting room compared to 200
- No kitchen facility available to meeting rooms
- No book sale alcove
- No reference service
- No public eating area
- 51 public seats in adult, children's and young adult areas compared to 102
- 16 computer workstations compared to 27
- No small meeting rooms
- No programming area for children
- No YA game table
- Smaller circulation desk

## IRONDEQUOIT PUBLIC LIBRARY - BUILDING PROGRAMS & BUDGET ANALYSIS

- No office for director
- Smaller computer room
- Smaller work tables for staff
- Less shelving and storage in staff area
- Smaller staff lunch room
- No loading dock

### **Summary**

There are other configurations for utilizing the 15,000 sq. ft. at the Evans branch that could be developed as an alternative to the above options. For example, a portion of the Evans collection could be transferred to McGraw. However, in all of these configurations, similar trade-offs would be required to fit the library's desired program into a 15,000 sq. ft. branch. These trade-offs and possible increased operating costs need to be examined closely to determine whether they are a preferred alternative to a single, larger facility located in the center of town or two equal sized facilities one located at the existing McGraw site and another located somewhere else on the West side of town that could accommodate a 25,000 sq. ft. branch.

## IRONDEQUOIT PUBLIC LIBRARY - BUILDING PROGRAMS & BUDGET ANALYSIS

### **BUDGET IMPACT - SINGLE FACILITY VS TWO BRANCHES**

Almost all libraries that expand their facilities will experience an increase in operating expenditures. The amount of that increase is determined by a number of factors that can vary greatly from library to library. For example, some libraries may elect to increase staffing levels to deal with an anticipated increase in public usage that almost always accompanies a major expansion. Others may add new services or add additional floors that require additional staff. Materials expenditures may increase in some cases because the library may now have space to allow its collections to grow or they may have added new formats. Other expenditures, such as utilities or equipment maintenance may be impacted due to expanded space and additional computer resources being made available.

It is imperative that a library have a good grasp on the potential impact that an expansion project will have on its operating budget before a decision to move forward is made. Failure to do so may result in a nice library facility but one that is understaffed and offering diminished public service. In the worst cases, a library may have to reduce its service hours to deal with unanticipated increased operating costs of a new facility.

This report seeks to minimize that risk for the Irondequoit Public Library by projecting potential cost increases associated with operating a single library facility versus two branches. Projected operating costs have been extrapolated from the operating costs reported by the library on its annual state financial report. The Consultant was not provided with operating cost data for each of the two existing branches. However, the Library Director has indicated that an accurate estimate can be achieved by dividing the total operating cost data reported by the library by two. The following table provides a breakdown of the library's 2004 operating expenditure using this methodology:

<b>Budget Category</b>	<b>Total</b>		<b>Evans</b>	<b>McGraw</b>
Salaries & Benefits	\$1,005,103	70.7%	\$502,551	\$502,552
Library Materials	\$263,832	18.5%	\$131,916	\$131,916
Office supplies	\$34,314	2.4%	\$17,157	\$17,157
Telecommunications	\$3,280	.2%	\$1,640	\$1,640
Postage & Freight	\$3,547	.2%	\$1,773	\$1,774
Building Operation and Maintenance	\$89,963	6.3%	\$44,981	\$44,982
Other miscellaneous	\$22,255	1.6%	\$11,127	\$11,128
Total Operating Fund Expenditures	\$1,422,294	100.0%	\$711,145	\$711,149
Capital expenditures	\$5,439			
Other disbursements	\$58,021			
Total operating fund disbursements	\$1,485,754			

The percentage of expenditures for each budget category is consistent with averages for libraries serving comparable sized communities within New York State, except that Irondequoit is spending a slightly higher percentage of its budget on library materials (18.5%) than other similar sized libraries (13.3%).

### **Potential impact of expansion**

The areas of a library's budget most impacted by an expansion project will normally include salaries and benefits, building maintenance, utilities, equipment maintenance and supplies. The level of increase will depend on the amount of square footage added, the number of computers, printers and other equipment requiring maintenance, and an expansion in the level of services provided to the community. In the case of Irondequoit, the increase in the amount of square footage will be significant (24,000 vs. 51,000). This increase in space will have a direct impact on utilities, maintenance, and staffing of service desks. In addition, an increase in the number of computers and printers connected to the library's network will increase cost shares paid to Monroe County Library System and will also impact the equipment maintenance budget.

## **IRONDEQUOIT PUBLIC LIBRARY - BUILDING PROGRAMS & BUDGET ANALYSIS**

It is important to note that the operating budget projections for the Irondequoit Public Library included in this report are meant to be illustrative and are based on the Consultant's assumptions regarding costs associated with operating a larger single library outlet or two larger branch outlets that will meet the requirements included in the Library's Building Program. It is recommended that the Library Director and Board of Trustees work together to develop more detailed budget projections based on operating assumptions unique to the Library.

### **Assumptions re: operating budget for expanded facility(ies)**

#### **Salaries and benefits**

##### Single facility scenario

It is assumed that, in spite of having a much larger facility and increased patron activity, staffing levels for a single facility serving the entire town of Irondequoit can remain stable, except for the addition of a part-time cleaner. The primary reason for projecting a stable workforce is that staff currently working at the Evans and McGraw branches will be combined in a single facility. The combined staff should be sufficient to deal with an anticipated 30% to 40% increase in usage that normally occurs following a library expansion project and it will enable staffing of a separate information desk in the Children's area of the library as called for in the Building Program. The combined staff should provide sufficient backup for each service desk. The number of available clerical staff, reference librarians, children's librarians, pages, cleaners will be double what is currently available in each branch.

##### Two-branch scenario

In the two-branch scenario, it is assumed that staffing at each branch will need to be increased to cope with increased circulation, and to provide coverage for a separate desk in the Children's portion of the library. Currently, the branches are able to service the entire floor (Children's and Adult) from one information desk in the Adult section of the library. This would likely not be the case if the branches were to be expanded to 25,000 sq. ft. each. Thus the staffing portion of the budget is projected to grow to accommodate an additional librarian to cover the Children's information desk at each branch. Additional part-time clerical staff is also budgeted for each branch to help cope with the expanded workload.

If the Library elects to operate a two-branch system utilizing the existing sites, with the Evans Branch expanded to 15,000 sq. ft. and the McGraw Branch expanded to 35,000 sq. ft., staffing costs are projected to be even higher. This is due to the requirement to staff an additional floor at the Evans branch, which has a limited site that prevents expanding the footprint of the building. Though the branch would likely have still have two information desks, it would be necessary to schedule additional staff to backup each desk to cover breaks and lunches. Also, the library would lose the ability to have only one person cover both information desks during slow periods.

#### **Library Materials**

##### Single Facility Scenario

It is assumed that the projected budget for materials for a single library serving the entire town would not require an increase, in spite of anticipated heavier usage. This is due to the fact that there currently is overlap between the collections at the McGraw and Evans Branches. A single library outlet configuration would enable staff to make more efficient acquisition decisions that are based on total demand within the town rather than having to be concerned with meeting demand at two separate branches. The resources freed up from unnecessary duplication of titles can be used to meet the increased public demand.

##### Two Branch Scenario

It is assumed that each branch would need to increase their respective book budgets over and above the rate of inflation, to meet heavier demand that will occur when the expanded facilities open their doors. Failure to do so may result in empty looking shelves and some patron dissatisfaction.

## **IRONDEQUOIT PUBLIC LIBRARY - BUILDING PROGRAMS & BUDGET ANALYSIS**

### **Office Supplies**

#### **Single Facility & Two-Branch Scenarios**

It is anticipated that the budget for supplies will need to be increased by approximately 25% for both a single facility and a two-branch scenario. This is primarily driven by increased patron activity that will impact circulation supplies and a significant increase in printing supplies that will result from having additional photocopy machines and computer printers.

### **Telecommunications**

#### **Single Facility & Two-Branch Scenarios**

Telecommunications costs associated with operation of a single facility should decrease based on the need to equip and service one facility versus two. Telecommunications costs should remain stable for a two-branch system.

### **Postage & Freight**

#### **Single Facility & Two-Branch Scenarios**

These costs are unlikely to be affected to a great degree by the expansion project.

### **Operation & Maintenance of Buildings**

It is assumed that this budget category includes utilities, and basic facility operating costs. Salaries for cleaners and maintenance staff are under salaries and benefits (see above).

#### **Single Facility Scenario**

Though the amount of space in the new library facility will be more than double of the space currently available, it is estimated that utility and other building maintenance costs will increase by only 50% over current levels. This projection is mainly impacted by the fact that there will be one highly efficient HVAC system rather than two older systems currently in operation. It is also assumed that the new facility will be much more energy efficient than the existing branches and that new heating and cooling systems will carry a manufacturer's warranty when installed. It is suggested that the Library consult an engineering firm to obtain additional information on the potential HVAC costs associated with a new facility or facilities.

#### **Two Branch Scenario**

The building maintenance and operation cost projections for a two branch scenario, assuming two new facilities of equal size, are assumed to be 75% higher than the current levels. Factors affecting the projected increase include new HVAC systems, new equipment warranties, more energy-efficient new facilities, and a doubling of the space at each branch.

If the Library elects to operate a two-branch system utilizing the existing sites, with the Evans Branch expanded to 15,000 sq. ft. and the McGraw Branch expanded to 35,000 sq. ft., utility and building maintenance costs are estimated to be 100% higher than current costs. This is due to continued use of the current facilities, which are less energy-efficient in design than a new facility or facilities would be.

### **Other Miscellaneous Costs**

It is assumed that this budget category includes equipment maintenance and contractual payments to the Monroe County Library System for participation in the CARL computer network. These payments are based on the number of computers connected to the library systems network.

#### **Single Facility Scenario**

The projected increase in this budget category for a single facility will be 30% based on the increase in the number of computers and printers that will be available. In addition, an additional cost is included for maintaining a security system for library materials that is called for in the Building Program.

#### **Two Branch Scenario**

## IRONDEQUOIT PUBLIC LIBRARY - BUILDING PROGRAMS & BUDGET ANALYSIS

Though the number of computer workstations and printers will be similar to the number in a single facility serving the entire town, this budget category for a two-branch system is higher due to the fact that there will be one additional library security system to maintain.

### Budget projections based on the above assumptions:

<b><u>Single Library Facility</u></b>	<b><u>Current</u></b>	<b><u>Projected</u></b>
Salaries & Benefits	\$1,005,103	\$ 1,025,103
Library Materials	\$ 263,832	\$ 263,832
Office supplies	\$ 34,314	\$ 42,893
Telecommunications	\$ 3,280	\$ 2,500
Postage & Freight	\$ 3,547	\$ 3,547
Operation and Maintenance - Buildings	\$ 89,963	\$ 134,945
Other Miscellaneous	<u>\$ 22,255</u>	<u>\$ 36,932</u>
Total Operating Fund Expenditures	\$1,422,294	\$ 1,509,752
Percentage increase in operating costs		<b>6%</b>

<b><u>Two Branch Budget Projection</u></b>	<b><u>Current</u></b>	<b><u>Projected</u></b>
Salaries & Benefits	\$ 1,005,103	\$ 1,155,103
Library Materials	\$ 263,832	\$ 277,024
Office supplies	\$ 34,314	\$ 42,893
Telecommunications	\$ 3,280	\$ 3,280
Postage & Freight	\$ 3,547	\$ 3,547
Operation and Maintenance of Buildings	\$ 89,963	\$ 157,435
Other miscellaneous	<u>\$ 22,255</u>	<u>\$ 44,932</u>
Total Operating Fund Expenditures	\$ 1,422,294	\$ 1,684,213
Percentage increase in operating costs		<b>18%</b>

Note: Projected costs in the above tables do not include normal inflationary increases in salaries, benefits and other operating costs. These should be factored in by the library in order to obtain a more accurate estimate of projected operating expenditures for an expanded facility or facilities.

### **Conclusion**

Based on the above assumptions and projections, it is the Consultant's opinion that the library could save nearly \$175,000 annually in operating costs if it elects to construct a single facility serving the entire town instead of two separate branches of equal size serving the eastern and western portions of the town.

Though the above analysis has focused on increased expenditures associated with the operation of expanded facilities, an even more critical question should be "Which configuration would better be able to weather a potential funding crisis that would force a decrease in the library's operating budget?" The answer to this question is fairly easy to ascertain. When it is necessary to "circle the wagons" due to a funding crisis, a single library facility provides much more flexibility. A single facility provides more flexibility in the deployment of staff while still maintaining a minimum level of public service; the materials budget can be stretched further; and there are less fixed building-related costs to cover.

The board and the community should consider these factors when making a decision to construct one library facility to two separate branches.

**EVALUATING THE OPTIONS – CONSULTANT’S RECOMMENDATIONS**

**Scenario 1 – Construction of a single facility serving the entire town vs. constructing two new branches, each serving a portion of the town.**

A single branch serving the entire town of Irondequoit would be more efficient to build and operate than two new branches, serving the east and west portions of the town. This is due to the fact that many components of the facility would need to be duplicated with separate branches. For example, a single facility would include only one computer room, one staff room, one staff work area, one loading dock area, one circulation desk, etc. Though the square footage assigned to these areas within a single facility would need to be larger, the square footage would be less than the combined total for the two branches. It is estimated that, in order to meet the library’s total building program requirements, almost 5,000 additional square feet would be needed with two branches compared to a single library facility. If construction costs are estimated at \$200 per square foot, the differential could be as great as \$1 million. Besides having the advantage of lower construction cost, a single library facility could result in operating budget savings of nearly \$175,000 per year. (See section above on “Budget impact: single facility vs two branches”). Building two new smaller branches to achieve parity in construction costs compared to a single facility is an option, but would result in significant reductions in the scope of library’s desired program and would have little impact on the differential in operating budgets between a single facility and two branches.

**Scenario 2 – Construction of a new single facility vs. expansion & renovation of the two existing branches**

The cost of renovating and expanding the existing library facilities could be lower than building a single new facility to serve the whole town. However, because there are significant limitations in the ability to expand on the existing Cooper Road site (15,000 sq. ft. maximum), the library’s goal of providing equal levels of public service to the east and west portions of the town will be difficult if not impossible to achieve. In order to meet the library’s program requirements and achieve parity in the level of public service provided at each branch, the west branch would need to be 26,251 sq. ft. This represents a gap of more than 11,000 sq. ft. Though a portion of this gap could be closed by moving additional non-public functions to the east branch, this would result in operational inefficiencies and potentially higher operational costs. If the library elects to partially solve the space differential by adding another floor to the west branch, it will face security challenges and potentially higher staffing costs. Public libraries located in semi-urban environments such as Irondequoit frequently do not assign a staff person to work alone on a floor because of security concerns, particularly in the evening hours. This requires libraries to assign more staff than would otherwise be necessary to operate the library during slower periods. An alternative would be to hire security staff or sophisticated monitoring equipment, but these solutions also will have an impact on operating expenses.

**Scenario 3 – Renovate but not expand either branch**

Based on Thomas Group estimates, the library would need to invest more than \$1 million to address code and accessibility issues and to upgrade the appearance of both existing branches. This option would not address the overcrowded conditions at the branches, would result in no service enhancements and would leave the library far short (24,000 sq. ft. vs. 50,000 sq. ft.) of the space requirements called for in the Building Program.

**Conclusions**

Viewing the situation exclusively from a library operations point of view, it is the opinion of the consultant that Scenario 3 be rejected outright because of its inability to address the library’s Building Program requirements. As for the remaining two options, a single facility serving the entire town would be the preferred option. A single facility would have the following advantages:

## IRONDEQUOIT PUBLIC LIBRARY - BUILDING PROGRAMS & BUDGET ANALYSIS

- The cost of constructing a new facility would be lower than constructing two new branches to achieve program requirements.
- The cost of operating a single facility would be lower than the cost of operating two separate library outlets (see section on “Budget impact: single facility vs two branches”).
- Staffing costs (salaries & benefits) account for the greatest portion of any library’s operating budget (70 to 80%). A single library facility will provide an opportunity for more efficient deployment of staff than dividing the same staff between two branches. Most libraries that expand their facilities experience a significant increase in usage that may result in a need to add staff. The Irondequoit public library would be more able to absorb that increase in activity without adding staff if it were able to focus its staff resources in one facility rather than two. Additionally, the library would better able to weather a future funding crisis in a single facility rather than with two branches, since fixed costs would be lower and there would be more flexibility in staff deployment.
- There would be less duplication in library resources. Though staff has indicated that the level of duplication in the collections of the two branches is relatively modest, it is assumed that the library will be able to save money on future acquisitions. This would be particularly evident in the number of multiple copies of popular materials that are purchased.
- Given constraints of the existing west branch site, residents served by that branch would be better served by a larger, state of the art, brand new facility located midway between the west and east branch than by having a lower level of library service in a 15,000 sq. ft. branch on the existing site. Though there is no survey data to confirm that most patrons already drive to each branch rather than walk, anecdotal comments from staff and random observations by the consultant suggest that this is the case, especially during the winter months. A slightly longer drive to a new facility would seem to be a minor inconvenience for patrons when compared to the amenities and enhancement in services they would encounter.
- The level of services available at a single facility would be greater than the services that could be provided from two branches located on the existing sites. Parking would be plentiful, additional programming would be available for children and adults; browsers would have access to significantly more material; more computers would be available; researchers would have more materials to work with; etc.

### **Caveat**

Though the consultant prefers the single library option to the two-branch scenario based on budget impact, operating efficiency, and service delivery, it is recognized that there may be other critical factors that will override these advantages and influence a final decision. The community must weigh the cost and service differential and reach a decision as to whether it wishes to pay a premium for operating two separate facilities within the town, each duplicating a portion of services found at the other.